

Tinti, Elisa

From: Tinti, Egidio
Sent: Monday, July 1, 2024 4:53 PM
To: Tinti, Elisa
Subject: Fw: [EXTERNAL EMAIL] Point by point

From: Kevin Donohue <keviequality@gmail.com>
Sent: Monday, July 1, 2024 4:48 PM
To: Tinti, Egidio <etinti@kingston-ny.gov>
Subject: [EXTERNAL EMAIL] Point by point

**RESOLUTION OF THE COMMON COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF KINGSTON, NEW YORK,
TO ADOPT A MEMORIALIZING RESOLUTION CALLING FOR AN IMMEDIATE
AND PERMANENT CEASEFIRE AND UNITING FOR PEACE.**

WHEREAS, the City of Kingston is united against all forms of violence and recognizes that all life is precious; and

[Except Jewish life.]

WHEREAS, the City of Kingston condemns all forms of racism, including but not limited to anti-Semitism and anti-Arab racism, islamophobia, fascism, white supremacy, anti-indigeneity, and xenophobia throughout the world; and

[Jews are the indigenous people of Israel, and calling out radical Islamist terrorism is not Islamophobic - there is no moral equivalence here.]

WHEREAS, the City of Kingston aspires to be a safe and welcoming community and is committed to promoting peace, unity, and respect for all residents and community members; and

[Bullshit - this is directed as Jews and Israel.]

WHEREAS, according to the United Nations World Food Program . . . people have been displaced from their homes, and there is a continued lack of food, healthcare, and potable water that has led to famine; and

[There is no famine in Gaza - this is Hamas propaganda that has been thoroughly debunked.]

WHEREAS, the City of Kingston recognizes the urgency of the human rights crises in Palestine and Israel and the need for immediate action; and

[Gaza created whatever crisis exists there.]

WHEREAS, the City of Kingston affirms that a lasting peace that affirms human rights can best be achieved through diplomatic means; and

[First, the Arabs have rejected over a dozen offers to negotiate peace since 1937 (see Peel Commission). Again, false equivalence between Israel that has always tried to find diplomatic resolutions and the Arabs who keep rejecting them, including all ceasefires in the current round of hostilities, just as they did in 2014. Neither the Civil war (in which my great-great-grandfather fought as a member of the Ulster Guard) nor WW II was resolved by diplomacy, and in this conflict, it is Israel that has tried and tried and tried.]

WHEREAS, the conflict in the Middle East has greatly affected many members of our Kingston community in the most intimate and horrifying ways; and

[It has created a hostile and dangerous environment for Jews - 'both sides' sounds so very woke but it is inconsistent with the facts.]

WHEREAS, we have seen an outpouring of poignant commentary advocating for peace, charity, and grace, and we have also seen how easy it is for bitter denunciation and insidious prejudice to take root; and

[Oh? Yahya Sinwar has been calling for "peace, charity, and grace"? Right.]

WHEREAS, the City of Kingston recognizes that we have the ability and opportunity to help ease the pain and divisions within our community through a statement of shared understanding.

[This is a one-sided statement that is pro-terrorist and anti-Jewish. It is causing pain for Jews. This is bullshit.]

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the City of Kingston calls upon our leaders in Albany and Washington to continue and extend their efforts to bring about an immediate, mutually agreed upon and permanent ceasefire in Israeli and Palestinian lands to protect and save human lives and to release all hostages; and

[LOL - Hamas will NEVER agree to a ceasefire, and the intent of this resolution is to impose a unilateral ceasefire on Israel - no intelligent person is being fooled. Hamas will violate any ceasefire within 24 hours, mark my words. Does this resolution propose cutting funds to Gaza or just Israel?]

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the City of Kingston calls upon our leaders in Albany and Washington to significantly expand funding and the supply of humanitarian aid to victims of this war and to provide increased support for the safety and prosperity of all inhabitants of the region; and

[All funding sent to Gaza ends up in Hamas' coffers, just as decades of aid funded the building of Hamas' terrorist infrastructure in Gaza. Whoever wrote this must think we are stupid.]

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the City of Kingston calls upon our leaders in Albany and Washington to end unrestricted, offensive military funding; and

[You forgot to say 'to Israel' - that is, of course, the intent here. Again, whoever wrote this must think we are stupid.]

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that we hereby resolve to focus on holding each other in community, even as we may disagree over issues that extend beyond our City; and

[LOL - just look at how the Hamas supporters on college campuses all over the US held Jewish students in community. Look at the attacks on President Biden's campaigning and LGBTQ Pride events by the pro-Hamas agitators - real community building.]

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the City Clerk is directed to send a copy of this resolution to President Joseph Biden, Senator Charles Schumer, Senator Kirsten Gillibrand, Congressman Patrick Ryan, New York Governor Kathy Hochul, State Senator Michelle Hinchey, Assemblywoman Sarahana Shrestha, Ulster County Executive Jen Metzger, Ulster County Legislative Chair Peter Criswell, Ulster County Legislative Majority Leader Abe Uchitelle, Ulster County Legislator Joseph Donaldson, Ulster County Legislator Greg McCullough, and Mayor Steve Noble.

[This is an embarrassment and Kingston should not be wasting time on it. These are all attacks on Israel and the Jews who have pride in their heritage. These resolutions are NOT being introduced by self-respecting Jews, but by idiots who support terrorists.]

Kevin Donohue
86A Fairmont Avenue
Kingston, NY 12401
(845) 303-4109

ATTENTION: This email came from an external source. Do not open attachments or click on links from unknown senders or unexpected emails.

Tinti, Elisa

From: Tinti, Egidio
Sent: Monday, July 1, 2024 3:25 PM
To: Tinti, Elisa
Subject: Fw: [EXTERNAL EMAIL] Ceasefire Resolution

From: Kevin Donohue <keviequality@gmail.com>
Sent: Monday, July 1, 2024 3:21 PM
To: Tinti, Egidio <etinti@kingston-ny.gov>
Subject: [EXTERNAL EMAIL] Ceasefire Resolution

This is absolutely idiotic - who is behind this, the idiots at the DSA? Is the City of Kingston calling upon Iran to stop funding Hamas, Hezbollah and the Houthis, or is it only Israel that should not get funding? And NEWS FLASH - it is Hamas that keeps rejecting one ceasefire after another.

Even the UN says there is plenty of aid going into Gaza, and the UN is hardly pro-Israel. It seems the people behind these anti-Jewish resolutions are getting a lot of their information from Hamas, a terrorist organization that has a well established history of lying.

This DOES NOT create unity - it ostracizes Jews and people who support Israel and creates a dangerous environment in which violence against us is escalating. I am a 64 year old gay man and I could not participate in any Pride events here in June because of this anti-Jewish, pro-Hamas hysteria - even the local LGBTQ center is run by Jew-hating bigots - how is this encouraging unity or building community? Quite the opposite, in fact. It is also NOT the job of provincial bureaucrats in Kingston to try to dictate US foreign policy - the City Council should focus on Kingston's problems (which are many) instead of blaming the world's problems on the Jews. A similar resolution was already defeated - will the DSA keep bringing it up over and over? Further such resolutions should not be given the time of day. This is outrageous. It also does not promote peace - imposing a unilateral ceasefire on Israel (let's be honest, that is what this is trying to do) will guarantee that the terrorists regroup and there will be more violence down the road. In fact, it will only encourage Iran to promote a war in Lebanon. The DSA and its supporters are anti-American and support our enemies.

Did Kingston pass a resolution on October 7th? Israel's war is both just and justified. These resolutions do nothing but 'virtue' signal - if supporting terrorists can be called virtuous - and scapegoat Jews and Israel for what is, at its core, a radical Islamicist problem. The fact that there are far greater conflicts going on in the world - even in the Mid-East (any resolutions against Erdogan for an actual genocide of Kurds? Any resolutions against al-Assad? How about condemning the Ayatollahs of Iran, who are murdering women's rights activists?) - this obsessive preoccupation with Israel can only be understood as being rooted in anti-Jewish hatred.

I understand that the pro-Hamas 'activists' are violent, loud, and disruptive, but caving into them is only going to encourage more of the same. No negotiating with terrorists! And more Americans support Israel - the volume of the pro-Hamas agitators does not reflect public opinion. Do NOT allow Kingston to be held hostage by these thugs.

Do what's right and resolve not to allow any more resolutions that vilify Jews.

Yours,
Kevin Donohue
86A Fairmont Avenue
Kingston, NY 12401
(845) 303-4109

ATTENTION: This email came from an external source. Do not open attachments or click on links from unknown senders or unexpected emails.

Dear Members of the City of Kingston Common Council:

As a homeowner in Kingston (on W. Chester St), I feel extremely lucky. Not only do I get to live in our vibrant community, but my monthly costs are relatively stable thanks to choices made by various state, local, and federal policy makers:

- The 30-year fixed-rate mortgage is a product of federal policy in the New Deal era and my low rate is a product of the low interest rate environment between 2009 and 2021.
- My homestead tax rate is low relative to non-homestead parcels in Kingston because of the decisions this council and other local bodies have made to set those rates differently.
- My tax rate is relatively stable year-over-year because of the deliberate and prudent financial decisions this council has made to balance spending against diverse revenue streams.

For all that, I should start this note with a big THANK YOU!

But many of our neighbors don't benefit from this constellation of decisions that make my comfortable life cheaper and more predictable. The rental real estate market in Kingston has turned unpredictable and unaffordable for ordinary people.

I've seen this in my work as Interim Executive Director of the Ulster Way of United County this spring and in my service as Chair of the Kingston Rent Guidelines Board. While these reflections are shaped by those roles, I want to be clear: I'm writing to you on my own behalf and in this letter speak only for myself, not as a representative of any organization or body.

With the generous support of this council's allocation of ARPA funds and various other local philanthropies, the United Way operates an emergency fund where residents can seek one-time assistance to pay bills that would, left unpaid, destabilize their lives. This spring, I had the responsibility of signing check after check primarily to landlords and Central Hudson for our neighbors who had fallen behind on their housing costs because of illness, injury, temporary job loss, or other emergency.

Even an ordinary challenge will mean that you can't make rent when – like about a third of our community – rent is more than half your income. It's hard to imagine building the financial stability and resilience needed to weather a cancer diagnosis or major car repairs when your rent expense goes up twice as fast as your income, as Pattern for Progress reports happened in our county last year.

The City of Kingston Common Council is doing a lot to respond to this housing emergency, as I well know. You declared an emergency pursuant to the Emergency Tenant Protection Act and have defended that decision in court, empowering the board that I chair to cap allowable rent adjustments in less than half of the City's rental units (only buildings completed before 1974 that have six or more units). You've passed a visionary zoning plan that hugely expands the possibility of creating new housing. You've made a pipeline of renovated and affordable homes in partnership with the Kingston Land Bank. You've continued to make decisions to encourage and subsidize creation and maintenance of affordable housing one project at a time, too.

All of this is laudable, but given the scale of the crisis we must continue to take every opportunity to address it.

This week, you have the opportunity to adopt additional tenant protections that extend protections against unjust evictions and rent gouging to tenants in unregulated buildings. More than half of tenants in Kingston live in buildings with 1-4 units that are not protected by the Rent Guidelines Board's determinations of what a fair rent adjustment is in a given year. This is the population of tenants that most needs Good Cause Eviction – but if the law is written to exclude landlords with four or fewer units in their portfolio, then the majority of them will never get basic protections.

The Good Cause law already excludes truly small landlords – people who live in their property and rent out other units are exempted. Any definition of a small landlord portfolio other than one unit opens the door to confusion for tenants who won't be able to confirm how many units their landlord owns, and opportunities for property owners to skirt the law's intentions.

I urge you to adopt the most expansive possible tenant protections this week. It won't be enough. Good Cause, as enacted by the state legislature, sets an unreasonably high threshold for challenging rent increases. Enacting these tenant protections, like opting in to the protections of ETPA for eligible buildings, is your responsibility but it does not end your responsibility.

You have heard, as my colleagues on the Rent Guidelines Board and I heard, the challenges of landlords facing their own cost challenges. These are real, of course, but the evidence that the Rent Guidelines Board had in front of it produced from surveys sent to landlords suggests that the increased costs and tightened belts that landlords describe are not present in the hard facts. For the ETPA-covered buildings that responded to DHCR's survey, costs declined slightly in the last year while operating margins meaningfully increased. Kingston building owners have significantly larger operating margins than those in Westchester or other ETPA counties.

Good Cause will provide some measure of protection for tenants and will not constrain landlords' ability to maintain their operating margins; you should adopt it.

And then continue to pursue every available opportunity to provide tenants the stability that local, state, and federal policies have provided me as a homeowner.

With great appreciation,

Noah Kippley-Ogman



SARAHANA SHRESTHA
Assemblymember 103rd District

THE ASSEMBLY
STATE OF NEW YORK
ALBANY

COMMITTEES
Aging
Energy
Local Government
Transportation
Tourism, Parks, Arts & Sports Development

MEMBER
Black, Hispanic, Puerto Rican, and Asian
Legislative Caucus
Women's Legislative Caucus
AAPI Taskforce
New Americans Taskforce

*Assemblymember Shrestha's Written Comments on Local Law 5 of 2024:
Prohibiting Eviction Without Good Cause*

New York State passed a version of good cause eviction through the state's budget that allows municipalities outside of New York City to opt-in. While this version leaves out thousands of upstate tenants in places where such an opt-in is unlikely, I always knew the City of Kingston would provide a glimmer of hope as one of the first localities to opt-in. I knew this because Kingston has led the state in tenant protections with the Rent Guideline's Board historic decision to reduce rent and by passing a local version of good cause protections in 2022.

During budget negotiations, a provision I fought diligently for allows municipalities to consider local conditions when defining the exemption based on the number of units in a landlord's portfolio—what it means to be a small landlord in New York City is not the same as what it means in Kingston. I'm thrilled that the currently-proposed Local Law 5 only exempts landlords who live on the premises or who only own one unit. I am writing today to encourage the Kingston Common Council to maintain that exemption.

State legislators and lawyers who argued against last minute compromises to the state's good cause law strongly believe that exempting portfolio sizes at a higher number of units will lead to the law not being enforceable or effective at all because of the prevalence of landlords who hide behind multiple LLCs. Though we passed the LLC Transparency Act last year, it will be several years before a directory is created, and the directory won't be disclosed to the public, due to changes the Governor made to the law before signing it. The only way the council can ensure Kingston tenants are protected under good cause is by covering tenants with landlords who own more than one unit. According to American Community Survey data, 60% of tenants in Kingston live in buildings with 1-4 units, so increasing the portfolio size exemption would leave out a significant number of renters.

The intention of the good cause law is to help stabilize neighborhoods by giving tenants a defense in court if their landlord tries to raise the rent by more than 10 percent. I trust that the intention of the Kingston Common Council is to protect tenants against price-gouging, and passing Local Law 5 as-is will do just that.

Tinti, Elisa

From: Tinti, Egidio
Sent: Monday, July 1, 2024 6:49 PM
To: Tinti, Elisa
Subject: Fwd: [EXTERNAL EMAIL] CEASEFIRE RES = SUPPORT FOR TERRORISM

Egidio Tinti
Chief of Police
City of Kingston Police Department

(845) 943-5766 Office
(845) 331-2166 Fax
etinti@kingston-ny.gov
<http://tinyurl.com/KPDTIPsoft>
www.facebook.com/kingstonpd

From: ucjfsafe <ucjfsafe@gmail.com>
Sent: Monday, July 1, 2024 6:13:59 PM
To: Tinti, Egidio <etinti@kingston-ny.gov>; UCJF Security <ucjfsafe@gmail.com>
Subject: [EXTERNAL EMAIL] CEASEFIRE RES = SUPPORT FOR TERRORISM

Besides all the recent attacks on Jews (in L.A., NYC, London, Toronto, Kazakstan, etc.) called for and justified by Iran/Hamas, there is now a Lawsuit in Federal Court in NY against Iran – Syria– Hamas for perpetrating the Murders of Civilians and Hostage taking on OCT 7. SEE–

<https://apnews.com/article/israel-hamas-lawsuit-iran-syria-north-korea-86460c28b0e7f8c6c8cd1fad6b1f5929>

Hamas won't agree to the latest version of the U.S. ceasefire agreement. But Kingston C.C. has its own version? WOW.

The Real Agreement –

- Release ALL Hostages & Bodies of Hamas–Murdered Hostage Victims immediately
- Stop all aggression, rocket fire, terrorism & attacks vs Israel immediately, including by Hezbollah, Houthis, Iraq Al–Quds and all other Iran–backed terrorists
- Israel will leave Gaza when the above occur.

–Harv Hilowitz
Chair, UC JFED, Israel Advocacy

Sent via the Samsung Galaxy A51 5G, an AT&T 5G smartphone

ATTENTION: This email came from an external source. Do not open attachments or click on links from unknown senders or unexpected emails.

Written Testimony to the Kingston City Council regarding adoption of Good Cause Eviction protection.

From the Hudson Valley Justice Center

By Ben Surface, Esq – Supervising Attorney

On July 2, 2024 the Kingston City Council has the opportunity to extend good cause eviction protections to the majority of tenants within the City of Kingston by adopting Section 213 of Article 6-A of the Real Property Law of the State of New York. This testimony is intended to explicitly provide legal and policy support for defining a “small landlord” as any landlord owning one (1) rental unit in the state of New York.

Real Property Law Section 213(2)(b) authorizes municipalities to “define ‘small landlord’ as a landlord of no more than *any number* of units in the state that the village, town, or city enacts by local law, provided that if such local law does not define ‘small landlord,’ a ‘small landlord’ shall mean a landlord of no more than ten unites in the state.” RPL 213(2)(b) (emphasis added). This statutory language grants the City of Kingston broad authority to define a small landlord based on the realities of its own local housing market and in such a way as to ensure that landlord cannot exploit loopholes in the law to deny otherwise eligible tenants the protections of this law.

In order to ensure the efficacy of Good Cause Eviction protection within the City of Kingston, the Council should define a small landlord as any landlord owning one (1) rental unit within the state for the following reasons:

1. The vast majority of tenants in the City of Kingston live in buildings with less than 5 units. Specifically, 60% of tenants live in buildings with 1-4 units. These units are already exempted from the Emergency Tenant Protection Act, which the city recently adopted, so opting into Good Cause and defining “small landlord” at one unit will ensure that these tenants receive some form of protection against evictions without cause.
2. Setting the “small landlord” definition at one unit does nothing to disturb the exemption provided to landlords who reside within the building they are renting to be exempted from the Good Cause Eviction law if their building has fewer than eleven units. The State Legislature has already sought to strike a balance between tenant protection and the property rights of landlords by carving out a large exemption for owner-occupied buildings.

3. Landlords routinely transfer ownership of their properties to LLCs. It is not uncommon for landlords to create separate LLCs for each building they own. If the City of Kingston defines a “small landlord” at a threshold above ownership of 1 unit, landlords will be able to obscure the size of their rental portfolio through distinct LLCs. While the law does state that separate LLCs with shared managing agents are deemed a single landlord for the purposes of determining portfolio size, there is no publicly available database of LLCs in the state of New York where tenants can look to determine whether their landlord owns other properties through different corporate entities. Furthermore, the majority of tenants who face eviction are unrepresented in their court proceedings and, without the assistance of counsel, it is unreasonable to expect that pro se tenants will be able to litigate the intricacies of their landlord’s various corporate holdings to expose whether they are rightfully entitled to the protections of the law. Furthermore, even when a tenant does have representation in an eviction proceeding, the loophole created by defining a small landlord any higher than one unit would remain a substantial vulnerability for tenants because there is no right to discovery in housing court proceedings. As a result, a tenant would have to be able to present prima facie evidence that their landlord may own additional units in order for the court to even consider allowing a tenant to seek the discovery to establish whether the tenant is entitled to protections of the law. Without discovery, tenants and their representatives are left to rely exclusively on the landlords’ compliance with Section 214 of the Good Cause law, which requires disclosures but imposes no statutory penalties for failure to do so.

If the city of Kingston is serious about extending protection against evictions without cause to the residents of this city, then the Council must define a “small landlord” as the owner of one rental unit in order to avoid creating a loophole that would create an opportunity for landlords to deny those protections to tenants through manipulations of their corporate structures.

Some have expressed concern that the City must demonstrate “a rational basis” or other legislative purpose to justify how to define a “small landlord.” As a preliminary matter it is important to point out that the statute does not set any such standard. Moreover, the statute explicitly authorizes municipalities to define “small landlord” as an owner of *any number* of units within the state. However, it is our hope that the above articulated reasonings for defining “small landlord” at one unit will help ease such concerns and

provide the City with ample basis to defeat any challenges, litigative or otherwise, to the decision to adopt good cause and define a “small landlord” as the owner of just one rental unit within the state.

Thank you for considering this written testimony and I welcome any opportunities to speak directly with members of the Council on this matter in the future.

Regards,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'BS', followed by a horizontal line extending to the right.

Ben Surface, Esq.
Supervising Attorney
Hudson Valley Justice Center
bsurface@hvjc.org
914-308-3490 x202

Tinti, Elisa

From: Tinti, Egidio
Sent: Monday, July 1, 2024 9:15 PM
To: Tinti, Elisa
Subject: Fwd: [EXTERNAL EMAIL] memorializing resolution

Egidio Tinti
Chief of Police
City of Kingston Police Department

(845) 943-5766 Office
(845) 331-2166 Fax
etinti@kingston-ny.gov
<http://tinyurl.com/KPDTIPsoft>
www.facebook.com/kingstonpd

From: Joel Mandelbaum <jmmd42@gmail.com>
Sent: Monday, July 1, 2024 8:34:52 PM
To: Tinti, Egidio <etinti@kingston-ny.gov>
Subject: [EXTERNAL EMAIL] memorializing resolution

To the Kingston Common Council:

I am writing to the Kingston Common Council to express my very reluctant support for the current version of the memorializing resolution that is being presented at the meeting on July 2, 2024; it seems to be less onerous than the previous option.

The process of presenting this resolution has brought out and amplified the divisiveness and disagreements in this community instead of diminishing them. The council did well to drop the resolution initially, but a vocal group persisted and got its way, albeit with a somewhat less disturbing result.

I am not a fan of memorializing resolutions, especially when they purport inaccurately to bring a community together. I guess this is the best we could hope for and at least it does not get into the messy and divisive business of assigning blame or taking sides in this ongoing conflict as the previous one did.

Yours truly

Joel Mandelbaum.

ATTENTION: This email came from an external source. Do not open attachments or click on links from unknown senders or unexpected emails.

Tinti, Elisa

From: courtney wilder <courtywilder@yahoo.com>
Sent: Monday, July 1, 2024 11:37 PM
To: Tinti, Elisa
Subject: [EXTERNAL EMAIL] Re: tomorrow's CC meeting and Ceasefire Res!

Dear Kingston Alders,

For the past few months, I've been joining my friends in rallying you all to pass a memorializing Ceasefire Resolution here in Kingston. I am a resident of Stone Ridge actually, just down the road, but I think of Kingston as my city, as the beating heart of my greater community, where all my roads, both literal and emotional, go to, and from. In my brief time joining my friends in their struggle to get this passed I have seen unforgettable moments of grace and fortitude from both my fellow community members and many of the Alders (Teryl, your original resolution is so thoughtful, thorough and warm. I am so grateful). I have also heard words of hate so wicked that they will become core memories of mine, bells that cannot be unrung, such as what we all endured at the June CC meeting. But nothing can be said to make any of us back down from this because the stakes are simply too high. I have seen the firsthand accounts from Palestinian journalists, (of which 1 in 10 are murdered) the results of white phosphorus on a baby's skin, bombed out hospitals, final notes from doctors and medical staff who refuse to leave their patients, the rubble of mosques and of universities- of which there are none left standing in Gaza. I have seen images that should not be real, children blown apart, neighborhoods reduced to rubble, lives and lineages snuffed out in a moment. I could spend pages listing the war crimes and proof of genocide, the "made in the USA" etched into every bomb and canister, the long receipt of billions of dollars that our government passes on to Israel with our tax dollars month after month. But you've heard all of that. You don't need more proof. You only need the courage and the encouragement to be reminded that this IS your job, it IS your business. Think of who you'd like to have been during Vietnam and be that person now. Because the person you are now is actually the truth of who you'd be in that time. And in this time we need to feel proud of Kingston for standing strong against genocide and apartheid and standing up for humanity.

Warmly,
Courtney Wilder
Stone Ridge, NY

-I am away and cannot be present tomorrow, I will be on zoom but understand that public comment is not happening in that format (totally get it!). If it's possible for my letter to be read aloud into record I would love that.

Thanks endlessly

Sent from my iPhone

ATTENTION: This email came from an external source. Do not open attachments or click on links from unknown senders or unexpected emails.

Tinti, Elisa

From: Arlene Cohen <akc0857@gmail.com>
Sent: Tuesday, July 2, 2024 6:59 AM
To: grunblattesq@aol.com
Cc: Tinti, Elisa
Subject: [EXTERNAL EMAIL] Re: June 24 UN update reducing likelihood of famine in Gaza

Thanks mark . Do you want this sent to the board
Sent from my iPhone

On Jul 1, 2024, at 11:00 AM, grunblattesq@aol.com wrote:

Dear Council members:

Here is a link to the newest United Nations report on water, food and services in Palestinian-ruled Gaza. It notes that famine has been averted in northern Gaza, through increased aid to the residents, though the situation remains extremely dangerous. In light of this, the UN view has shifted since the first proposed resolution. I do not believe this requires a change to the most recent proposal, but hope this gives us all better insight to present conditions.

<https://www.un.org/unispal/document/ipc-famine-third-review-report-25jun24/>

Mark Grunblatt

ATTENTION: This email came from an external source. Do not open attachments or click on links from unknown senders or unexpected emails.

Tinti, Elisa

From: P Tenney <slaughteredpeanut@yahoo.com>
Sent: Monday, July 1, 2024 8:56 AM
To: Tinti, Elisa
Subject: [EXTERNAL EMAIL] Public Comment to Common Council Ceasefire resolution

Common Council Members,

While in general I think the push by some in our community to pass this resolution has exacerbated the polarization in our community, I want to thank the community members that have worked to balance the perspective and re orient us towards our own affected community members. In general I don't support the council passing a resolution, but this may be the best version we're going to get if we do.

I take exception to the fourth clause's statement "...which has led to famine". The U.N. based their information on the FEWS NET Integrated Food Security Phase Classification, which warned of imminent famine (not current famine). That report just underwent an internal investigation by the Famine Review Committee. The review states "The FRC has some concerns with the methods by which the situation with regard to food availability in northern Gaza was calculated, which, combined with an incomplete understanding of food access makes the FEWS NET conclusions tenuous." And that many of the predictions of famine "are not supported by the available evidence for the current period of analysis." The FRC review also estimates that Gaza would have 109% of its caloric needs met according to its low estimates – 157% at its high estimate by that data excluded by the FEWS NET report. The report is available on ipcinfo.org

This is not to dismiss the suffering or lack of food security that Gazans are facing at the hands of many actors, and the current classification is still at "risk of famine". But at no point has there been famine, there *has* been a significant and meaningful increase of aid, and at best there just isn't a clear picture yet. This resolution should not include statements that are not fact.

Thank,
Pallu Tenney

ATTENTION: This email came from an external source. Do not open attachments or click on links from unknown senders or unexpected emails.

Tinti, Elisa

From: Chavah Halevi <chavah@yourspeed.com>
Sent: Thursday, June 27, 2024 4:09 PM
To: Tinti, Elisa
Subject: [EXTERNAL EMAIL] ADDENDUM to comment 6/20/2024 re: proposed memorializing resolution calling for ceasefire in Gaza

Dear Members of the Common Council, City of Kingston, NY:

I am sending here the **United Nations website link** to the "**Dissenting opinion of Vice-President Sebutinde**" referenced in (2) as "important suggested reading" in my written public comment emailed 6/20/2024 (see copy below):

**APPLICATION OF THE CONVENTION ON THE PREVENTION AND PUNISHMENT
OF THE CRIME OF GENOCIDE IN THE GAZA STRIP
(SOUTH AFRICA v. ISRAEL)**

[Dissenting opinion of Vice-President Sebutinde](#)

<https://www.un.org/unispal/wp-content/uploads/2024/05/192-20240524-ord-01-01-en.pdf>

Sincerely,
Mrs. Chavah Halevi

From: Chavah Halevi <chavah@yourspeed.com>
Subject: proposed memorializing resolution calling for ceasefire in Gaza
Date: June 20, 2024 at 3:20:39 PM EDT
To: Eliza Tinti <cityclerk@kingston-ny.gov>

B"H

Dear Members of the City of Kingston Common Council,

My name is Chavah Halevi. I am a Jewish resident of the Ponckhockie neighborhood in the City of Kingston since 1996.

(1) I am writing to ask that you take into consideration the negative impact on our local community that passing the proposed resolution can produce; whereby the City of Kingston will be on record endorsing all the misinformation and false accusations against the government of Israel contained in the resolution, despicable falsehoods which are being used to demonize *all* American Jews together with Israeli Jews.

Constant tirades of false accusations against Jews are fueling Jew-hatred in mainstream America, facilitating crimes of harassment, verbal and physical intimidation, even actual violence against Jewish men, women, and children.

There is a legitimate concern that passing resolutions like the current proposed resolution will provide encouragement to those who aim to target our Jewish community locally, Heaven forbid.

(2) At the 6-4-2024 meeting my three minutes to "public comment " ran out before I could finish, and so thank you for stating during that meeting, that those who didn't get to finish their public statement could add to their statement in writing. And so I will just add the following important suggested reading if you are considering endorsing the proposed resolution:

UN International Court of Justice (ICJ) Vice-President Julia Sebutinde contextualizes many issues of concern brought to the ICJ by South Africa, accusing Israel of Genocide and other war crimes, in her

Dissenting opinion of Vice-President Sebutinde

Document Number 192-20240524-ORD-01-01-EN

Parent Document Number 192-20240524-ORD-01-00-EN

Case 192 - Application of the Convention on the Prevention and Punishment of the Crime of Genocide in the Gaza Strip (South Africa v. Israel)

Date of the Document Fri, 05/24/2024 - 12:00

Document File Document **192-20240524-ord-01-01-en.pdf**

Judge Sebutinde sheds light on the reasons for her dissenting opinion in the case *South Africa v. Israel*, including *The broader context of the war in the Gaza Strip; The humanitarian situation in the Gaza Strip* and several Orders to Israel issued by the Court.

(3) Let me conclude with the words of **Rep. Alexandria Ocasio-Cortez**: *"The callousness, dehumanization and targeting of Jews on display at last night's protest outside the Nova Festival exhibit was atrocious antisemitism—plain and simple," the Democratic congresswoman tweeted. "Antisemitism has no place in our city nor any broader movement that centers human dignity and liberation."*
(<https://www.jns.org/as-antisemitism-rises-a-campaign-heats-up-to-discredit-the-term>)

Thank you, esteemed Common Council members for allowing all sides to speak.
Pass-NOT the proposed resolution, *please*.

Yours truly,
Chavah Halevi
DuBois St.
Kingston, NY 12401
(845) 340-1854

ATTENTION: This email came from an external source. Do not open attachments or click on links from unknown senders or unexpected emails.

Tinti, Elisa

From: Galo Pampa <galovasquezsr@gmail.com>
Sent: Thursday, June 27, 2024 3:58 PM
To: Shaut, Andrea; Tinti, Elisa; Pasti, Sara; Tierney, Michael; Scott-Childress, Reynolds; Edwards, Jeanne; Mickens, Teryl; Dennison, Bob; Andrews, Drew; Schabot, Steven; Hirsch, Michele
Subject: [EXTERNAL EMAIL] Ceasefire

Dear Common Council members,

Regardless of the distress that arose from June's council meeting, we are grateful for the opportunity to participate in our city government and look forward to continuing to engage in thoughtful discussion as we address pressing community concerns together.

We extend our deepest gratitude to Alder Mickens, Alder Andrews, Alder Hirsch, and Alder Tierney for supporting a clear ceasefire resolution to the Council. Thank you for listening to the hours of public comment and hearing the voices of community members calling for an end to this horrific violence. To the Alders who have yet to sign on and support this resolution: Please hear us! Represent our city as a community of love, peace, and conscience! Unanimously adopt a memorializing resolution for an immediate, permanent ceasefire in Palestine now!

We want Kingston to join Beacon, Newburgh, Hudson, Albany, and more than 100 other US municipalities in calling for an end to crimes against humanity that would not be possible without US material and political support. While we suffer rising food prices, job insecurity, a dire housing crisis, and a climate catastrophe hastened by military action; households in our city contribute an estimated \$347,753 annually to the Israeli military through federal taxes. We need to sound the alarm to our elected officials in Albany and Washington, stating firmly and unequivocally: "Not in our name and not with our tax dollars!" We cannot continue subsidizing a military that has brutally killed over 40,000 Palestinians, left tens of thousands unidentifiable, and thousands more buried under rubble. Our tax dollars are being used to burn children alive in their displacement camp tents, rain white phosphorus down on whole neighborhoods, and use starvation as a weapon of war and means of collective punishment.

We are driven to advocate for our city government to pass a ceasefire resolution by the love we feel for one another, for the whole of our city, for humanity, and for our planet.

1) Lakhani, Nina. "The Staggering Carbon Footprint of Israel's War in Gaza." Mother Jones, January 13, 2024. <https://www.motherjones.com/politics/2024/01/gaza-israel-war-hamas-carbon-emissions-climate-damage/>.

2) US Campaign For Palestinian Rights (USCPR). "Methodology." Not My Tax Dollars, 2024. <https://www.notmytaxdollars.org/methodology>.

3) United Nations Office for the Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs. "Occupied Palestinian Territory." OCHA, 2024. <http://www.ochaopt.org/node/10572>.

4) AJLabs. "Israel-Gaza War in Maps and Charts: Live Tracker." Al Jazeera, June 11, 2024. <https://www.aljazeera.com/news/longform/2023/10/9/israel-hamas-war-in-maps-and-charts-live-tracker>.

5) Allegra Goodwin, Avery Schmitz, Kathleen Magram, and CNN. "US-Made Munitions Used in Deadly Strike on Rafah Tent Camp, CNN Analysis Shows." CNN, May 29, 2024. <https://www.cnn.com/2024/05/28/middleeast/gaza-us-munitions-rafah-strike-analysis-intl-hnk/index.html>.

6) Vinall, Frances. "Israel Appears to Use White Phosphorus in a Post Verified Video. What Is It?" Washington Post, October 13, 2023, sec. Middle East. <https://www.washingtonpost.com/world/2023/10/13/white-phosphorus-chemical-what-is/>.

7) Bigg, Matthew Mpoke. "Here's What to Know About the Hunger Crisis in Gaza." The New York Times, April 11, 2024, sec. World. <https://www.nytimes.com/2024/04/11/world/middleeast/gaza-famine-hunger-crisis.html>.

Galo Vasquez

Kingston Resident

Ward 9

ATTENTION: This email came from an external source. Do not open attachments or click on links from unknown senders or unexpected emails.

Tinti, Elisa

From: grunblattesq@aol.com
Sent: Monday, July 1, 2024 11:01 AM
To: Tinti, Elisa
Subject: [EXTERNAL EMAIL] June 24 UN update reducing likelihood of famine in Gaza

Dear Council members:

Here is a link to the newest United Nations report on water, food and services in Palestinian-ruled Gaza. It notes that famine has been averted in northern Gaza, through increased aid to the residents, though the situation remains extremely dangerous. In light of this, the UN view has shifted since the first proposed resolution. I do not believe this requires a change to the most recent proposal, but hope this gives us all better insight to present conditions.

<https://www.un.org/unispal/document/ipc-famine-third-review-report-25jun24/>

Mark Grunblatt

ATTENTION: This email came from an external source. Do not open attachments or click on links from unknown senders or unexpected emails.

Tinti, Elisa

From: Tinti, Egidio
Sent: Tuesday, July 2, 2024 9:09 AM
To: Tinti, Elisa
Subject: Fw: [EXTERNAL EMAIL] Ceasefire Resolution

From: Kevin Donohue <keviequality@gmail.com>
Sent: Tuesday, July 2, 2024 6:11 AM
To: Tinti, Egidio <etinti@kingston-ny.gov>
Subject: [EXTERNAL EMAIL] Ceasefire Resolution

If they want a ceasefire - RELEASE THE HOSTAGES!

Hamas can stop this war but chooses not to - so only people who hate Jews will call on Israel to surrender. The choice is Hamas'. Israel should not be held accountable for what Hamas does.

My roots in Kingston go back to 1660 - but now I'm thinking it's time to leave.

Kevin Donohue
86A Fairmont Ave.

ATTENTION: This email came from an external source. Do not open attachments or click on links from unknown senders or unexpected emails.

Tinti, Elisa

From: Shaut, Andrea
Sent: Tuesday, July 2, 2024 9:57 AM
To: Alderman
Subject: Fw: [EXTERNAL EMAIL] Regarding tomorrow's cc meeting and Ceasefire res!

Please see below for an email that came directly to me but was intended for the full Council. As you can see, I already responded to the author explaining that we do not read comments aloud.

Sincerely,

Andrea Shaut

Council President, City of Kingston

From: Shaut, Andrea <ashaut@kingston-ny.gov>
Sent: Tuesday, July 2, 2024 9:55 AM
To: courtney wilder <courtywilder@yahoo.com>
Subject: Re: [EXTERNAL EMAIL] Regarding tomorrow's cc meeting and Ceasefire res!

Good morning,

Thank you for sharing your thoughts. I will pass your email on to the rest of the Common Council. We do not read written comments aloud for the record; however, I assure you that every council member reads and considers all written comments as thoughtfully as we listen to any public speaking.

Sincerely,

Andrea Shaut

Council President, City of Kingston

From: courtney wilder <courtywilder@yahoo.com>
Sent: Monday, July 1, 2024 11:34 PM
To: Shaut, Andrea <ashaut@kingston-ny.gov>
Subject: [EXTERNAL EMAIL] Regarding tomorrow's cc meeting and Ceasefire res!

Dear Kingston Alders,

For the past few months, I've been joining my friends in rallying you all to pass a memorializing Ceasefire Resolution here in Kingston. I am a resident of Stone Ridge actually, just down the road, but I think of Kingston as my city, as the beating heart of my greater community, where all my roads, both literal and emotional, go to, and from. In my brief time joining my friends in their struggle to get this passed I have seen unforgettable moments of grace and fortitude from both my fellow community members and many of the Alders (Teryl, your original resolution is so thoughtful, thorough and warm. I am so grateful). I have also heard words of hate so wicked that they will become core memories of mine, bells that cannot be unring, such as what we all endured at the June CC meeting. But nothing can be said to make any of us back down from this because the stakes are simply too high. I have seen the firsthand accounts from Palestinian journalists, (of which 1 in 10 are murdered) the results of white phosphorus on a baby's skin, bombed out hospitals, final notes from doctors and medical staff who refuse to

leave their patients, the rubble of mosques and of universities- of which there are none left standing in Gaza. I have seen images that should not be real, children blown apart, neighborhoods reduced to rubble, lives and lineages snuffed out in a moment. I could spend pages listing the war crimes and proof of genocide, the "made in the USA" etched into every bomb and canister, the long receipt of billions of dollars that our government passes on to Israel with our tax dollars month after month. But you've heard all of that. You don't need more proof. You only need the courage and the encouragement to be reminded that this IS your job, it IS your business. Think of who you'd like to have been during Vietnam and be that person now. Because the person you are now is actually the truth of who you'd be in that time. And in this time we need to feel proud of Kingston for standing strong against genocide and apartheid and standing up for humanity.

Warmly,
Courtney Wilder
Stone Ridge, NY

-I am away and cannot be present tomorrow, I will be on zoom but understand that public comment is not happening in that format (totally get it!). If it's possible for my letter to be read aloud into record I would love that. Thanks endlessly

Sent from my iPhone

ATTENTION: This email came from an external source. Do not open attachments or click on links from unknown senders or unexpected emails.

Tinti, Elisa

From: Shaut, Andrea
Sent: Tuesday, July 2, 2024 9:57 AM
To: Alderman
Subject: Fw: [EXTERNAL EMAIL] Regarding tomorrow's cc meeting and Ceasefire res!

Please see below for an email that came directly to me but was intended for the full Council. As you can see, I already responded to the author explaining that we do not read comments aloud.

Sincerely,

Andrea Shaut

Council President, City of Kingston

From: Shaut, Andrea <ashaut@kingston-ny.gov>
Sent: Tuesday, July 2, 2024 9:55 AM
To: courtney wilder <courtywilder@yahoo.com>
Subject: Re: [EXTERNAL EMAIL] Regarding tomorrow's cc meeting and Ceasefire res!

Good morning,

Thank you for sharing your thoughts. I will pass your email on to the rest of the Common Council. We do not read written comments aloud for the record; however, I assure you that every council member reads and considers all written comments as thoughtfully as we listen to any public speaking.

Sincerely,

Andrea Shaut

Council President, City of Kingston

From: courtney wilder <courtywilder@yahoo.com>
Sent: Monday, July 1, 2024 11:34 PM
To: Shaut, Andrea <ashaut@kingston-ny.gov>
Subject: [EXTERNAL EMAIL] Regarding tomorrow's cc meeting and Ceasefire res!

Dear Kingston Alders,

For the past few months, I've been joining my friends in rallying you all to pass a memorializing Ceasefire Resolution here in Kingston. I am a resident of Stone Ridge actually, just down the road, but I think of Kingston as my city, as the beating heart of my greater community, where all my roads, both literal and emotional, go to, and from. In my brief time joining my friends in their struggle to get this passed I have seen unforgettable moments of grace and fortitude from both my fellow community members and many of the Alders (Teryl, your original resolution is so thoughtful, thorough and warm. I am so grateful). I have also heard words of hate so wicked that they will become core memories of mine, bells that cannot be unrung, such as what we all endured at the June CC meeting. But nothing can be said to make any of us back down from this because the stakes are simply too high. I have seen the firsthand accounts from Palestinian journalists, (of which 1 in 10 are murdered) the results of white phosphorus on a baby's skin, bombed out hospitals, final notes from doctors and medical staff who refuse to

leave their patients, the rubble of mosques and of universities- of which there are none left standing in Gaza. I have seen images that should not be real, children blown apart, neighborhoods reduced to rubble, lives and lineages snuffed out in a moment. I could spend pages listing the war crimes and proof of genocide, the "made in the USA" etched into every bomb and canister, the long receipt of billions of dollars that our government passes on to Israel with our tax dollars month after month. But you've heard all of that. You don't need more proof. You only need the courage and the encouragement to be reminded that this IS your job, it IS your business. Think of who you'd like to have been during Vietnam and be that person now. Because the person you are now is actually the truth of who you'd be in that time. And in this time we need to feel proud of Kingston for standing strong against genocide and apartheid and standing up for humanity.

Warmly,
Courtney Wilder
Stone Ridge, NY

-I am away and cannot be present tomorrow, I will be on zoom but understand that public comment is not happening in that format (totally get it!). If it's possible for my letter to be read aloud into record I would love that. Thanks endlessly

Sent from my iPhone

ATTENTION: This email came from an external source. Do not open attachments or click on links from unknown senders or unexpected emails.

Tinti, Elisa

From: Starfish <starfishery@protonmail.com>
Sent: Tuesday, July 2, 2024 2:02 PM
To: Tinti, Elisa; Pasti, Sara; Tierney, Michael; Scott-Childress, Reynolds; Edwards, Jeanne; Mickens, Teryl; Dennison, Bob; Andrews, Drew; Schabot, Steven; Hirsch, Michele
Subject: [EXTERNAL EMAIL] Ceasefire Resolution and Good Cause Eviction

Dear members of the Common Council,

I am writing once again to ask you to pass a resolution calling for a permanent ceasefire in Palestine and to pass Good Cause Eviction with the strongest possible protections for tenants.

I am sure that by now you are all familiar with the facts of the issue: over 37,000 Palestinians have been killed by Israeli attacks. The vast majority of these deaths have been civilians, and over 15,000 have been children. Bombs have targeted hospitals, schools, and homes, and millions of people have been displaced and left without food, water, shelter, and medical care. All of this has been done with the support of billions of dollars in aid from the US—money that has come directly from our tax dollars.

While our tax money is being used to kill and displace innocent people across the world, we are experiencing our own crisis of displacement right here, with nearly 40% of New Yorkers burdened by unaffordable housing costs, and many people in our own city losing their homes and being forced out of the community. The money we are paying to destroy the lives of Palestinian families could instead be used to support families in our own communities. Please join us in calling on our government to end all military and financial support to Israel, and to work for an immediate and permanent end to the atrocities being done in our name and with our money.

Please vote tonight to pass a resolution calling for a permanent ceasefire, and please vote to pass the strongest version of Good Cause Eviction.

Thank you,

Emily Taylor
Ward 5, Kingston

Sent with [Proton Mail](#) secure email.

ATTENTION: This email came from an external source. Do not open attachments or click on links from unknown senders or unexpected emails.

