

CITY OF KINGSTON
Heritage Area Commission
planning@kingston-ny.gov

Suzanne Cahill, Planning Director



Steven T. Noble, Mayor

HERITAGE AREA COMMISSION MEETING

August 28, 2019

CITY HALL-420 BROADWAY-Conference Room 2, 7 PM

MINUTES

COMMISSION MEMBERS PRESENT:

Hayes Clement, Chairman

Dean Barnes

Bernard Matthews

Abigail Robin

Michael Del Priore

Kevin McEvoy

EXCUSED:

Bonnie Rutski, Vice Chairman

CITY STAFF & OFFICIALS:

Suzanne Cahill, Planning Director

Julie Edelson-Safford, Historic Preservation Administrator & Secretary

Reynolds Scott Childress, Ald. Ward 3, HAC Liaison (Absent)

Steve Knox, Director BSD (Absent)

Charles Polacco, Planning Board Representative (Absent)

Mark Grunblatt, HLPC Representative (Absent)

OTHERS PRESENT:

GENERAL BUSINESS: The Chairman called the meeting to order at 7:00 PM.

- Exits/Bathrooms
- Please Silence Cell Phones
- Conversations outside of Conference Room
- Respect other applicants

I. Open forum for public comment.

Tanya Garment of 102 Wurts St. read the following letter on behalf of Marissa Marvelli of 60 Noone Lane:

In regards to the application to replace 24 historic windows at 23 & 27 West Strand. The West Strand is arguably the most striking architectural assemblage in Kingston. It continues to be a remarkable testament to the city's once-thriving waterfront commerce. It was for these reasons that the preservation of the West Strand was an early focus of Kingston's Landmarks and Heritage Area programs. A defining feature of these ca. 1870 Italianate façades is the historic arched windows. Replacing them with squared units and cladding the arches is wholly inappropriate. Such a change would

CITY OF KINGSTON
Heritage Area Commission
planning@kingston-ny.gov

Suzanne Cahill, Planning Director



Steven T. Noble, Mayor

negatively impact the architectural integrity of the row and greatly compromise its character. The Kingston Urban Cultural Park Plan, which underpins the work of this commission, specifically calls for the City/Commission to impose additional controls within these historic districts which require that rehabilitation of all buildings...shall be done in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation (UCP, Ch. 5, Sec. 7, pg. 36.)" *Standard #6: Deteriorated features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture and, where possible, materials.* Unlike modern windows, old wood windows are designed to be taken apart for repair. It is why they can last so long. Common issues like broken glass, failed glazing, deteriorated wood, and missing weather-stripping are easily repairable and can drastically improve the energy efficiency of the units. The costs associated with window restoration is competitive with that of replacements, and the work has greater integrity. Emily Majer of White Clay Kill Preservation is a window restoration specialist active in the Kingston area. She offers free consultations: emily@whiteclaykillpreservation.com. Given the iconic nature of the West Strand, it is imperative that the Commission promote a strong preservation ethic as it renders its advisory opinion on this application.

Giovanna Righini of Ward 5 read the following:

I know that the Commissioners are all familiar with the Kingston Urban Cultural Park Draft Management Plan, which serves as the original basis for the Heritage Area Commission's advisory work. Tonight I am here to put a reminder of it on the public record. As you review tonight's materials, the HAC should have a clear understanding of the responsibility of its advisory role in structuring comments for the HLPC. Per the Preservation Plan Approach in Part V, page 28, the Review Board is clearly laid out as follows: "One of the most potent tools in promoting preservation is architectural and design review. The areas identified above [which include the Stockade District and West Strand] will be placed under the jurisdiction of the HLPC, the City's existing preservation-oriented board. Standards and procedures set forth in the local laws establishing this Commission and creating the Stockade Historic and Architectural Design District will be applied to these areas as will applicable provisions in the recently adopted City zoning law and preservation standards established by the Secretary of the Interior..."Continued under Preservation Standards and Guidelines in Part V, page 35, the Zoning Ordinance is noted as establishing preservation standards, guidelines and procedures within the City's historic districts. "Applicable portions of the Revised Zoning Ordinance require Landmark Commission review and approval of all applications for any changes made within these districts including construction, reconstruction, alteration, restoration, removal, demolition or painting. These requirements apply to all buildings, structures, out-buildings, walls, fences, steps, topographical fixtures, earthworks, landscaping, paving and signs." It goes on to describe requirements imposed by the ordinance pertaining to all aspects of compatibility with existing and adjacent architecture and character. "In short, every conceivable element of significance and compatibility." And so, also in short, if it is in a historic district, design review decisions are the purview of the HLPC. While the HAC can and should make comments, it should also make sure to clearly defer final decisions to the HLPC.

2. Adoption of minutes of July 24, 2019. See Attached. Upon motion duly made by Commissioner Dean Barnes and seconded by Commissioner Bernard Matthews, the Commissioners present unanimously approved the minutes of the July 24, 2019 meeting.

NEW BUSINESS:

3. 9-17 & 21 N. Front St. & 51 Schwenk Drive/The Kingstonian Redevelopment of the City of Kingston Parking Garage Property, the Herzog's Warehouse property and the Uptown Grill property. Project includes: 420 car

CITY OF KINGSTON
Heritage Area Commission
planning@kingston-ny.gov

Suzanne Cahill, Planning Director



Steven T. Noble, Mayor

parking structure, 131 apartments, 32 hotel rooms and 8000 sq. ft. of general retail/commercial space. Project further includes a pedestrian plaza on a portion of Fair Street that divides the current parcels. SBLs 48.80-1-25, 48.80-1-26, 48.80-2-24.120, Zone C-2, Stockade Historic District, Mixed Use Overlay District, HAC, HLPC, Ward 2-1, Kingston Development LLC & JM Development Group, applicants; Herzog's Supply Co. Inc. and City of Kingston, owners.

The Chairman introduced the project and reminded the Commission that their role in reviewing the application is advisory, and that the focus at this point is primarily on the visual impact study and the Architect's presentation. The Chairman advised the Commission to weigh in with any concerns, and to consider the project at this time with the expectation of coming to a consensus in the next meeting, or subsequent meeting. Frank Campagne, of Tri State Associates Marketing gave a brief background on those involved in the project and introduced the objectives the Kingstonian's design, spoke of new renderings available, then introduced Steve Mackenzie of Mackenzie Architects. Mr. Mackenzie discussed the ideas and justifications behind his design. The Commission did not vote on the project.

4. 33 N. Front St. Signage application for new business. Double-sided overhanging 48"W X 36" H digitally printed matte overlam on 1/2" white PVC, held up by sign clips, quick links, and chain affixed to Pike Plan canopy. SBL 48.314-2-3.110, Zone C-2, Stockade Historic & Mixed Use Overlay Districts, HAC, HLPC, Ward 2-1, SEQR Determination. Jay and Sandy Wilson, applicants; John Perry, owner.

Sandy Wilson, the applicant, was present. It was established that the sign meets code requirements. Upon motion duly made by Commissioner Dean Barnes and seconded by Commissioner Abigail Robins, the Commissioners present unanimously voted to declare this matter a Type II action under SEQRA. Upon motion duly made by Commissioner Bernard Matthews and seconded by Commissioner Dean Barnes, the Commissioners present unanimously voted to approve the signage application as presented with the condition that the applicant obtain insurance naming the City as additionally insured as per §358-9 Projections and Obstructions of the City's legislation.

5. 270 Fair St. Signage application for overhanging 4 sq. ft. 24" x 24" x 3/4" thick Extira primed and painted white surface, v-carved letters primed and painted black, secured by a 30" x 2" square arm hanging bracket in black, white painted sign clips, and black eyehooks. SBL 48.331-4-20, Zone C-2, Stockade Historic & Mixed Use Overlay Districts, HAC, HLPC, Ward 2-1, SEQR Determination. Timely Signs of Kingston, applicant; Hudson Valley Kingston Development LLC, owner.

Tyson McCasland presented the application. Upon motion duly made by Commissioner Bernie Matthews and seconded by Commissioner Dean Barnes, the Commissioners present unanimously voted to declare this matter a Type II action under SEQRA. Upon motion duly made by Commissioner Michael Del Priore and seconded by Commissioner Kevin McEvoy, the Commissioners present unanimously voted to approve the signage application as presented with the condition that the applicant obtain insurance naming the City as additionally insured as per §358-9 Projections and Obstructions of the City's legislation.

6. 105 St. James St. Installation of 5.355 kw solar PV array on existing roof consisting of 17 panels. SBL 56.91-5-10, Zone R-2, HAC, Ward 4-1, SEQR Determination. Stacie Varian/TESLA Energy Operations, applicant; Elizabeth Roessler, owner.

CITY OF KINGSTON
Heritage Area Commission
planning@kingston-ny.gov

Suzanne Cahill, Planning Director



Steven T. Noble, Mayor

Tesla representative Mark Basil was present. Upon motion duly made by Commissioner Dean Barnes and seconded by Commissioner Bernie Matthews, the Commissioners present unanimously voted to declare this matter a Type II action under SEQRA. Upon motion duly made by Commissioner Kevin McEvoy and seconded by Commissioner Michael Del Priore, the Commissioners present unanimously voted to approve the solar panel installation as presented.

7. 1 Albany Ave. Removal of main entry steps, installation of ADA accessible concrete ramp for Governor Clinton Apartments. SBL 48.80-1-12.110, Zone O-2, HAC, Ward 2-2, SEQR Determination. Paul B. Jankovitz P.A., applicant; Development Fund Corp. Landmark Preservation Housing, owner.

Paul Jankovitz P.A. presented the application. Upon motion duly made by Commissioner Michael Del Priore and seconded by Commissioner Abigail Robins, the Commissioners present unanimously voted to declare this matter a Type II action under SEQRA. Upon motion duly made by Commissioner Michael Del Priore and seconded by Commissioner Abigail Robins, the Commissioners present unanimously voted to approve the ADA accessible concrete ramp installation as presented.

8. 81 West Pierpont St. Exterior renovations including the removal of existing entrances, installation of new entrances and doors, new walkway and stairway, new siding and soffit, and new colors. SBL 56.42-5-5, Zone R-T, HAC, Ward 9-3, SEQR Determination. Chris Konoski, applicant and owner.

Chris Konoski represented the application. Upon motion duly made by Commissioner Dean Barnes and seconded by Commissioner Bernard Matthews, the Commissioners present unanimously voted to declare this matter a Type II action under SEQRA. Upon motion duly made by Chairman Hayes Clement and seconded by Commissioner Abigail Robins, the Commissioners present unanimously voted to approve the renovations with the condition that a permit for any sidewalk work be obtained from the Department of Public Works, and with the recommendations that the exterior design be more cohesive, painted in one continuous color rather than the gray and blue proposed and that the applicant does more to unify the facade, with the use of clapboard, Hardie board, or stucco rather than vinyl for the exterior.

9. 23 & 27 West Strand St. Replacement of 24 windows, infill of arch-top masonry window openings to accommodate standard full frame replacements. SBL 56.43-5-32 & 56.43-5-33, Zone R-T, Rondout Historic District, HAC, HLPC, Ward 8-1, SEQR Determination. Eric Deising & Samir Hrichi, applicants, Old Capital Property LLC, owners.

Eric Deising and Samir Hrichi represented the application. As the applicants were directed to seek the expertise of local historic restoration expert Emily Majer, and that could not be accomplished by this meeting, they were advised to do their due diligence in obtaining pricing from major manufacturers for arched aluminum clad replacement windows, to follow through with Emily Majer and determine for sure whether restoration is an option, and to seriously consider historic tax credits to alleviate part of the financial burden. Julie Edelson-Safford presented the page Restoration/Replacements, VI. 20 of the Kingston Urban Cultural Park Draft Management Plan, which illustrates what type of window restoration should be approved, and which should be denied, to reinforce the Commission's position that it could not approve the replacements as presented. Upon motion duly made by Commissioner Bernard Matthews and seconded by Commissioner Kevin McEvoy, the Commission unanimously voted to table the matter until the next meeting.

CITY OF KINGSTON
Heritage Area Commission
planning@kingston-ny.gov

Suzanne Cahill, Planning Director



Steven T. Noble, Mayor

-
10. 654 Broadway Exterior renovation of façade and replacement of commercial door and two windows. SBL 56.25-2-3, Zone C-2, Broadway Overlay District, Broadway Overlay District, HAC, Ward 4-2, SEQR Determination. Richard Barger, applicant, John & Frank Piccoli, owners.

Richard Barger and Frank Piccoli Jr. presented the application. The prevailing opinion of the Commission was to restore the current storefront, but Mr. Piccoli Jr. maintained that the storefront's condition was beyond repair or restoration, and he really wanted a new look. Upon motion duly made by Commissioner Dean Barnes and seconded by Commissioner Michael Del Priore, the Commissioners present unanimously voted to declare this matter a Type II action under SEQRA. Upon motion duly made by Commissioner Bernie Matthews and seconded by Commissioner Abigail Robin, the Commissioners present unanimously voted to approve the exterior renovations as presented.

11. 302 Clinton Ave. Repainting of exterior wooden trim and main door for the 2019 Kingston Design Showhouse. SBL 48.80-1-23, Zone C-2 & Stockade Historic District & Mixed Use Overlay District, HLPC, Ward 2-2, SEQR Determination. Amanda Sanchioni, applicant; Julie & Sean Griffin, owners.

Amanda Sanchioni presented the application. Upon motion duly made by Commissioner Dean Barnes and seconded by Commissioner Michael Del Priore, the Commissioners present unanimously voted to declare this matter a Type II action under SEQRA. Upon motion duly made by Commissioner Abigail Robin and seconded by Commissioner Michael Del Priore, the Commissioners present unanimously voted to approve the repainting of the exterior as presented.

DISCUSSION:

12. Planter - North Front Street Parking Lot
Looking good.
13. National Alliance of Preservation Commissions Commission Assistance and Mentoring Program Training.
The preservation CAMP will be held close by in the Spring, White Plains, and Newburgh. The cost per person is \$30 the day and includes lunch.
13. Budget Overview - YTD \$785.00 (Est budget for FY 2019 is \$700)
14. Next Meeting - September 25, 2019, 7 PM Conference Room #2, City Hall

Chairman Hayes Clement called for a motion to adjourn the meeting at 9:17 PM, Commissioner Dean Barnes so moved, Commissioner Kevin McEvoy seconded, all were in favor.